



MICHIGAN  
HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES  
P.O. Box 30014  
LANSING, MICHIGAN 48909-7514

Minutes of the House Standing Committee  
on  
Education Reform

---

Wednesday, June 14, 2017

8:15 a.m.

Room 307 House Office Building

The House Standing Committee on Education Reform was called to order by Representative Tim Kelly, Chair.

The Clerk called the roll; members present were **Representatives Kelly, Hornberger, Crawford, Garcia, Roberts, Alexander, Griffin, Lilly, Noble, Reilly, Zemke, Brinks, Chang, Camilleri, and Sowerby. (15/15)**

The Clerk announced that a quorum was present.

\_\_\_\_\_

The Chair laid before the committee the minutes of June 8, 2017 as printed.

**Representative Lilly moved to adopt the minutes of June 8, 2017, as printed.**

**There being no objection the motion prevailed by unanimous consent of the members present; the minutes were adopted as printed.**

\_\_\_\_\_

The Chair laid before the committee House Bill 4647.

**HB 4647 (Albert)**

Retirement; public school employees; defined contribution only for employees hired after certain date; require, and provide for other general amendments.

The Chair informed the committee members about a New York Times article about Pennsylvania's public employee pension plan. A copy is attached.

The Chair offered the substitute (H-1) for House Bill 4647.

**Representative Hornberger moved to adopt the substitute (H-1) for House Bill 4647.**

**The motion prevailed by an affirmative vote of a majority of the members appointed to and serving on the committee, voting as follows:**

**Yeas: Representatives Kelly, Hornberger, Crawford, Garcia, Roberts, Alexander, Griffin, Lilly, Noble, and Reilly;(10/15)**

**Nays: Representatives Zemke, Brinks, Chang, Camilleri, and Sowerby. (5/15)**

The substitute was adopted

Representative Thomas Albert, the bill sponsor, explained the bill and substitute to the bill. Questions followed.

Nick A. Khouri, Michigan's State Treasurer, and Kerrie Vanden Bosch, Director of the Office of Retirement Services in the Department of Technology, Management and Budget, testified in support of the bill. Questions followed.

Anthony Randazzo, Director of Economic Research for Reason Foundation representing the Pension Integrity Project, testified using a PowerPoint presentation on Michigan Pension Solvency and Reform. Questions followed. Copy of the PowerPoint is attached.

Jarrett Skorup, Marketing and Strategic Outreach Manager at the Mackinac Center, testified in support. Questions followed.

Todd Tennis, a lobbyist representing American Federation of Teachers of Michigan, testified in opposition to the bill. Questions followed.

---

At 9:50 a.m., the Chair went at ease at the call of the Chair.

At 12:33 p.m., the Chair reconvened the committee.

The following individuals submitted testimony cards wishing to speak earlier, but were not present:

Peter Lund, State Director for the Michigan chapter of Americans for Prosperity, and.

Nick Ciaramitaro, President of the Coalition for Secure Retirement-Michigan and the Legislative Director for Michigan AFSCME. \*

\*Submitted written testimony.

Amanda Fisher, Assistant State Director for the Michigan Office of the National Federation of Independent Business, testified in support. Copy of her written testimony is attached.

Peter Spadofore, Associate Executive Director for Government Relations for the Michigan Association of School Administrators, testified in opposition to the bill. Questions followed.

Representative Zemke offered and explained the substitute (H-3) for House Bill 4647. Questions followed.

Representative Zemke asked Bethany Wicksall, Deputy Director of the House Fiscal Agency, to explain the Legislative Analysis for the (H-3) substitute. Questions followed. Copy of her handout is attached.

**Representative Zemke moved to adopt the substitute (H-3) for House Bill 4647.**

**The motion did prevail by an affirmative vote of a majority of the members appointed to and serving on the committee, voting as follows:**

**Yeas: Representatives Zemke, Brinks, Chang, Camilleri, and Sowerby, (5/15)**

**Nays: Representatives Kelly, Hornberger, Crawford, Garcia, Roberts, Alexander, Griffin, Lilly, Noble, Reilly. (10/15)**

The substitute was not adopted

The following individuals submitted testimony cards in opposition to the bill, but did not wish to testify:

Jerry Johnson, representing Barry, Branch, Calhoun, Jackson, Lenawee, and Monroe Intermediate School Districts;

David Randels, Director of Government Relations for Oakland Schools;

Aaron Keel, Assistant Director of Government Relations for the Michigan Association of School Boards;

Christina Canfield, representing the Michigan Education Association;

Annalisa Grunwald, Director of Government Affairs for Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators;

Bill Black, Legislative Director for the Michigan Teamsters;

Stephanie Glidden, Director of Public Affairs for Michigan AFL-CIO;

Dr. Bill DeFrance, Eaton Rapids Public Schools Superintendent;

Kathleen Merry, Executive Director of Legislative Affairs for Wayne RESA; and

Bob Kefgen, Director of Government Relations for Michigan Association of Secondary School Principals.

Mary Pollock, Legislative Representative for the Michigan State Employee Retirees Association and Government Relations Coordinator for AAUW, submitted written testimony from the following groups in opposition to the bill:

Michigan State Employee Retirees Association;

Michigan Parent and Teacher Association;

the Rochester Community Parent and Teacher Council; and

the American Association of University Women of Michigan.

John Baublitz from Saline, Michigan submitted written testimony in opposition to the bill.

The following individuals submitted testimony cards in support of the bill, but did not wish to testify:

Beth DeShone, Advocacy Director for the Great Lakes Education Project;

Tony Daunt, Director of Operations at the Michigan Freedom Fund;

Wendy Block, Director of Health Policy and Human Resources for the Michigan Chamber of Commerce;

Alicia Urbain, Vice-President of Governmental and Legal Affairs for the Michigan Association of Public School Academies; and

Pete Constant, Chief Executive Officer for the Retirement Security Initiative.\*

\*Submitted written testimony.

Representative Roberts submitted a fiscal impact chart for House Bill 4647 for the committee members, which is attached.

Judy Hart submitted written testimony in opposition to the bill.

**Representative Garcia moved to report House Bill 4647 with the recommendation that the substitute (H-1) be adopted and that the bill then pass.**

**The motion prevailed by an affirmative vote of a majority of the members appointed to and serving on the committee, voting as follows:**

**Yeas: Representatives Kelly, Hornberger, Crawford, Garcia, Alexander, Griffin, Lilly, Noble, and Reilly, (9/15)**

**Nays: Representatives Zemke, Brinks, Chang, Camilleri, and Sowerby, (5/15)**

**Pass: Representative Roberts. (1/15)**

The bill and substitute were referred to Second Reading.

There being no other business before the committee; **Representative Griffin moved to adjourn the meeting.**

The motion prevailed, the time being 12:53 a.m.

The Chair declared the Committee adjourned.

---

Tim Kelly, Chair  
House Standing Committee on Education Reform

---

Joy Brewer, Committee Clerk

---

Date approved by the committee